

Legislative Assembly,

Wednesday, 16th September, 1914.

	PAGE
Ministerial Statement—The Legislative Council and the Income Tax (War Emergency)	1358
Bill	1358
Complimentary remarks	1371

The SPEAKER took the Chair at 4.30 p.m., and read prayers.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT—THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL AND THE INCOME TAX (WAR EMERGENCY) BILL.

The PREMIER (Hon. J. Scaddan, Brownhill-Ivanhoe) [4.31]: I have to express my regret to hon. members that it has been found necessary to ask them to re-assemble here to-day merely for the purpose of my moving that the House adjourn over the general elections. Members of course will understand that I was unable to foresee exactly what attitude another place would take or adopt in connection with the measure that was before them when we last adjourned, and it was therefore necessary that we should be here to receive any message that came forward. I regret to say that no message has been received. This is due to the fact that another place thought fit, on the second reading, to reject the measure. I want to take this opportunity, before the House finally adjourns, of saying that the Government are prepared to accept the full responsibility for their proposal, and even at this stage to say deliberately and definitely that I absolutely decline to allow the second Chamber, which is not expected, and was never intended, to control the financial affairs of the State, or dictate terms to the Government. The time has arrived when something will have to be done for the purpose of providing that this House, which represents the whole of the taxpayers of the State, and not one section of them, shall have complete control of financial matters, and I am not going to give—

Hon. Frank Wilson: The Premier will excuse me. I think it is highly

out of order for him to attack another Chamber when no motion at all is before the House.

The PREMIER: There is a motion for adjournment.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Let the attack be made in the proper place, and not here. If the Premier wishes to make a statement, which he has already done, well and good, but to take the opportunity of attacking another place in this way is highly disorderly, I should say.

Mr. SPEAKER: I cannot object to the Premier's remarks, as he intends to move a motion.

Hon. Frank Wilson: He intends to move a motion! I submit, Sir, that you do not know that.

Mr. SPEAKER: The Premier has intimated to me that he intends to move the adjournment of the House.

Mr. Male: Is it in order to discuss a motion for the adjournment of the House? Should not the question be put without discussion forthwith according to the Standing Orders?

Mr. SPEAKER: On ordinary occasions no discussion is allowed, but the present occasion is a special one. The House is being adjourned indefinitely.

Mr. Carpenter: It is a Ministerial statement.

Mr. A. A. Wilson: Why object to it?

Hon. Frank Wilson: There is nothing in the Standing Orders dealing with a special occasion. Standing Order 46, dealing with a motion for adjournment reads—

A motion "That the House do now adjourn" shall always be in order if made without interrupting a member when speaking, and, if seconded, shall be forthwith put from the Chair.

The Minister for Lands: That is a motion "That the House do now adjourn."

Hon. Frank Wilson: That is the motion that is to be moved. The Speaker told me so. We have nothing before the House. A statement by the Premier is always in order, if the House gives that indulgence.

Mr. O'Loughlin: Why not submit to it.

Hon. Frank Wilson: And listen to an attack on another place? I say this is highly disorderly.

Mr. SPEAKER: Will the Premier kindly give me the wording of his motion?

The PREMIER: The motion is, "That the House at its rising adjourn until Tuesday, 3rd November."

Mr. SPEAKER: The motion is entirely distinct from an ordinary motion for adjournment.

Hon. Frank Wilson: The Premier can give his reason for the adjournment but cannot attack another place.

The PREMIER: Hoping that the leader of the Opposition is now satisfied that I am entitled to make a statement to the House and to the country—

Hon. Frank Wilson: I am not satisfied that the Premier is entitled to make any attack upon another place.

The PREMIER: I regret that this is not acceptable to the leader of the Opposition. There is no better place where the Government should make a statement when another place interferes with the course of their business than in the House itself.

Hon. Frank Wilson: The Premier has no right to do it.

The PREMIER: This Chamber is representative of the whole of the taxpayers of the State, and the whole of the population of the State, and it is through this Chamber that the Government are entitled to express their opinion freely and untrammelled and without interference from anybody.

Hon. Frank Wilson: The Premier has done that already.

The PREMIER: I will repeat it. I had an opportunity last night while sitting in another place of hearing the debate upon the measure which was sent up from this Chamber. But I heard on that occasion nothing whatever to do with the Bill, but a great deal of personal abuse.

Hon. Frank Wilson: I must protest. The Premier is discussing a debate in another place. There is such a thing as fair play. I have never heard of such a hit below the belt as this. It is not fair play. Wait till I get on the hustings. I will give the Premier all

he wants. Let the Premier go on the platform if he wants to vent his opinion of another place.

The PREMIER: What I propose to do is to uphold the privileges of this Chamber.

Hon. Frank Wilson: The Premier is abusing the privileges of this Chamber.

Mr. SPEAKER: The leader of the Opposition has taken exception to the Premier's allusion to a debate occurring in another place during the session. I must ask him not to pursue that line of discussion.

The PREMIER: I regret, Sir, that that should be your ruling, because, as I said, I had an opportunity of listening to the debate in the Council yesterday evening, and, as I was trying to explain, the debate touched the measure for scarcely a moment.

Hon. Frank Wilson: The Premier is discussing the debate now.

The PREMIER: Let the hon. member wait a moment. The debate in the Council was nothing but an attack upon this Chamber, and more particularly upon the Government. The whole of the discourse of hon. members in another place was on the statements which had been made here by Ministers—

Mr. SPEAKER: Order! Standing Order No. 127 provides that—

No member shall allude to any debate in the other House of Parliament, or to any measure impending therein. The hon. the Premier must not allude to the debate in the other Chamber. No allusion must be made to that debate.

The PREMIER: Do I take it, Mr. Speaker, that if I allude to the Council's action, without referring to its debate, that I shall be out of order? I have never heard of such a contention. Surely the leader of the Opposition is aware of, and will appreciate, the fact that the House of Lords and the House of Commons have frequently come into conflict on financial questions, and that the House of Commons in those circumstances has suspended all other business to debate the attitude of the House of Lords. Here we are acting on the same principle in Western Australia, where the right of controlling the finances is

in the hands of the Legislative Assembly; and yet when another Chamber attacks that right, we are not to be allowed even to allude to the matter. Surely I am in order in at least alluding to the action of another Chamber in rejecting this financial measure.

Hon. Frank Wilson: When we adjourned last night, it was understood from the Premier's own mouth that we would meet here formally this afternoon to receive any messages which might come from the Legislative Council. It was further understood that if there were no messages to be considered, we would then merely adjourn. Now the Premier has taken advantage—

Hon. W. C. Angwin (Honorary Minister): The Premier did not say that.

Hon. Frank Wilson: That was the arrangement with the Premier; and hon. members on this side have, on that understanding, proceeded to their homes in the country. I object to any discussion of the action of another Chamber taking place this afternoon. It is unfair; it is unconstitutional; it is not fair practice.

Mr. O'Loughlen: Of course, the other place is always scrupulously fair.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Let the Premier go on the platform and make his statement.

The Minister for Works: It is his duty to make it here.

Hon. Frank Wilson: No.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order! The Standing Orders are perfectly clear. The Standing Orders are provided for the guidance of this House, and no hon. member will for a moment maintain that there is anything indefinite in this Standing Order. It is absolutely definite. Houses of Parliament elsewhere may have discussed the action of other Chambers, but I think such discussion must have taken place on a definite motion. At all events, while I do not know what other Parliaments may have done in this connection, I do know that the Standing Order bearing on the point is perfectly clear; and I intend to adhere to it.

The PREMIER: I desire to submit the following motion:—"That the attitude adopted by the Legislative Council

towards financial proposals is a distinct breach of the rights and privileges of the Legislative Assembly."

Hon. Frank Wilson: I protest against this. We have already a motion before the House, to which motion we are committed. That motion is: "That the House at its rising do adjourn until Tuesday, the 3rd November." We must deal with that motion first.

Mr. Bolton: That motion has not been moved yet.

Mr. SPEAKER: Although the Premier did not move that motion, but merely intimated his intention of moving it at the conclusion of his remarks, there is an objection to the motion he now proposes to move—an objection which I think is fatal, namely, that notice must be given of a motion of this character.

The PREMIER: But the Standing Orders are suspended.

Mr. SPEAKER: The resolution suspending the Standing Orders does not apply in this case. The resolution for the suspension of the Standing Orders, carried on the motion of the Premier, was—

That during the present session so much of the Standing Orders be suspended as to admit of the introduction of Bills without notice and the passing of same—

"Of same;" that is, of Bills.

through all their stages in one day.

The PREMIER: I suppose I will have to leave the question of the attitude adopted by another Chamber until some other occasion.

Mr. SPEAKER: The Premier, in moving that the House at its rising adjourn to the 3rd November, may give the reasons for the adjournment, as for instance its being owing to certain legislation having been defeated in another place, but he must not allude to the debate or reflect on the discussion.

The PREMIER: That is exactly the attitude I was going to adopt. I was going to point out, as I did at the outset of my remarks, that we merely assembled to-day for the purpose of adjourning to a definite date, to carry us over the period of the general elections. I explained

that we met to-day for the purpose also of dealing with any Messages that might have been received from the Council, but that no Messages having come forward, it would be necessary to adjourn without transacting any business. The necessity for this is due to the fact that another place has rejected a financial proposal. I suppose I am not able even to refer to the fact that according to the Constitution of the Mother of Parliaments and to the Constitution of the Parliament of Western Australia, under which we are operating, this Chamber carries the responsibility for all financial proposals, and particularly those in connection with Supply, and the manner in which it shall be provided for His Majesty, in the respect that this House is the only Chamber where taxation proposals can be initiated, and thus it carries with it the responsibility for all financial matters. During the past three years we have endeavoured to carry on the finances of the State in accordance with the policy enunciated by this party at the last general election and which received the endorsement of the vast majority of the people.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Is this the reason for the adjournment?

The PREMIER: Yes, the adjournment is to permit of that policy being again submitted to the electors, together with the question of the attitude adopted towards the Government's proposals by another place. Quite a number of people in the community, including the Opposition in Parliament, have endeavoured to show that the method proposed for raising revenue for tiding us over the present difficulties was not a correct one, and that other methods might have been adopted by the Government which would have got over the difficulty much easier than would this. The leader of the Opposition will at once recognise that the Government themselves must carry the responsibility for their financial proposals, and it is not to be expected that the Government can accept advice on matters of this nature from the Opposition.

Hon. Frank Wilson: What has this to do with the adjournment?

The PREMIER: I exceedingly regret that it should be so unpleasant to the leader of the Opposition.

Hon. Frank Wilson: I submit that the Premier is entirely out of order. He is going over the debate we had on the Bill he has been referring to.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order! I do not see the hon. member's point.

Hon. Frank Wilson: The Premier is continuing the argument which you have ruled out of order.

Mr. SPEAKER: The hon. member is keener than I am. I have been waiting to see to what debate the Premier was referring, and I have not discovered it yet. Neither the point raised by the leader of the Opposition nor the remarks of the Premier have any bearing on the motion.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Then why should the Premier continue?

The PREMIER: It is rather a remarkable position we have arrived at, namely, that in Parliament members of the Government are not permitted to place before the public the position they find themselves in as the result of the action of Parliament; and for the leader of the Opposition, who has previously occupied the position of head of a Government, to say that Parliament is not the place where we are entitled to express an opinion on these matters is absurd.

Hon. Frank Wilson: I have never done that. You are absolutely out of order.

The PREMIER: Of course, from the hon. member's point of view, I am. But I want to point out that the Government have to carry certain responsibilities, and I am coming to the point that while we have endeavoured to meet the newly arisen difficulties in accordance with the best interests of the community as a whole, in accordance with the policy of our party, which is that everybody shall bear their fair share of the burden of taxation, we are now to have the direction of affairs taken out of our hands. It is a condition which no Government would tolerate.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Well, resign; that is the obvious remedy.

The PREMIER: If I could see any benefit that would accrue from my resigning; if, for instance, the hon. member was in a position to form an Administration and carry on affairs—

Hon. Frank Wilson: I can.

The PREMIER: Even in the hon. member's wrath there is some merriment. For him to assert that in his present position he could form an Administration is as absurd as could be. What I am pointing out is that between now and the meeting of Parliament, even if we meet on the early date suggested in the motion, we will be called upon to administer the affairs of the State and will be looked to by the people to find employment for the unemployed, to assist industries that to-day are suffering severely owing to the crisis which has overtaken the Empire, and also to relieve the depression that exists in the agricultural districts. As the Government responsible for the control of finances we have approached Parliament with a proposal for meeting those difficulties, to tide us over those difficulties, not merely during the period of the general election, but until such time as we can find other ways and means of relieving the situation. Whatever may be the opinion in regard to the wisdom of the proposal of the Government, as I pointed out previously, it could not be expected that the Government should go to the Opposition and ask for advice on matters in connection with the finances.

Hon. Frank Wilson: What has this to do with the motion for adjournment?

Mr. SPEAKER: Order! I must uphold the point raised by the leader of the Opposition. These remarks by the Premier have nothing to do with the motion for adjournment.

The PREMIER: I have not moved the adjournment.

Mr. SPEAKER: Then the Premier has no right to speak unless he is moving the motion which he proposed to do.

The PREMIER: I have not suggested that I proposed to do it,

Mr. SPEAKER: Then there can be no further discussion.

The PREMIER: There is going to be further discussion. I am not going to be sat on in this manner.

Mr. Male: Order! Do not defy the Chair.

Mr. SPEAKER: I will ask the Premier to apologise for having defied the Chair. I am not going to occupy this Chair and be browbeaten by any member of the House.

The PREMIER: If you take it that I have browbeaten you, I sincerely regret it. I have not moved the adjournment, and I am entitled—

Mr. SPEAKER: Order! The hon. member will resume his seat. I will give him the opportunity of moving his motion. I will refrain from saying anything further.

The PREMIER: I hold I have the right to submit a motion.

Mr. Male: Apologise first.

The PREMIER: I have already apologised.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order! The hon. member will resume his seat.

The PREMIER: I cannot speak when I am sitting down. I have already apologised.

Mr. SPEAKER: The hon. member will take his seat, and then rise again.

The PREMIER: I cannot move any motion without rising.

Mr. SPEAKER: The hon. member rose to apologise. He has apologised, and now he may rise and move the motion he intends to table.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Move the adjournment.

The PREMIER: I will do so when I am ready, not before.

Mr. Bolton: Perhaps you can run another place, but you cannot run this place.

Hon. Frank Wilson: What is the question before the House.

Mr. SPEAKER: There is no question before the House.

Mr. Male: Then go on with the orders of the day.

Hon. Frank Wilson: There must be some business; we cannot sit here without doing anything.

Hon. W. C. Angwin (Honorary Minister): That the House suspend from 6.15 till 7.30.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Be sensible.

Mr. Allen: He cannot be sensible.

The PREMIER: As I do not know the particular Standing Order, may I ask your direction as to how I can make a statement dealing with the present situation.

Mr. SPEAKER: By the indulgence of the House, the Premier can make a statement, but he must conform with the Standing Orders.

Hon. Frank Wilson: A statement is not an attack.

Mr. O'Loughlen: Adjourn and make a statement outside.

The PREMIER: Well, I ask the indulgence of the House to make a statement.

Mr. SPEAKER: Is it the wish of the House that the hon. the Premier should make a statement?

Members: Aye.

Mr. SPEAKER: The hon. member may make a statement.

The PREMIER: Seeing I have the privilege to make a statement, I suppose I can cover the same ground as a predecessor did when in a similar position to myself. If hon. members turn up *Hansard* of 1907, page 18, they will find that the then Premier, Sir Newton Moore, made a statement in connection with the action of the Council in rejecting a financial proposal. For the life of me I cannot understand why the leader of the Opposition in particular, should take exception to me on this occasion following the example set by his former leader.

Hon. Frank Wilson: I am not taking any exception to your making a statement, but to your unfair tactics in attacking another place and threatening its members, and also breaking faith with me when you said you would adjourn without doing any business this afternoon.

The PREMIER: The hon. member is absolutely incorrect in that statement. The only arrangement I made with him was across this Chamber in the hearing of every member. I never consulted the hon. member.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Your words are in *Hansard*.

The PREMIER: I do not care; I asked the leader of the Opposition whether it would be desirable to adjourn, rather than sit until midnight on Tuesday, in order to receive any Message from another place. He said—"What will we do to-morrow?" and I said—"We will deal with the Messages if there are any to deal with."

Hon. Frank Wilson: But you spoke to me about it.

Mr. Male: And said country members might go home.

The PREMIER: I never mentioned country members at any time.

Mr. Male: I heard you.

Mr. Bolton: I was with him and did not hear it.

The PREMIER: Even if that were the case, the fact remains I could not foresee that another place would reject, the financial measure. I was not in a position to say we would not discuss any matter. I have not introduced any new business; I am discussing the political situation, and although it is unpleasant to the hon. member, I am exercising the right I possess to make a statement.

Hon. Frank Wilson: You can make a statement as to what you will do as a matter of policy, but you cannot attack me or another place.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order! I will see that no attacks are made on the Opposition or on another place.

The PREMIER: I was pointing out that the Government introduced this financial measure to meet the present situation created owing to the war and to the agricultural depression, and have not been able to obtain the consent of Parliament to it with the result that we have now to carry on as best we can with the means at our disposal. The Government are not prepared to take the responsibility for the conditions which may prevail from now until the new Parliament assembles.

Hon. Frank Wilson: But you must.

The PREMIER: The responsibility we are prepared to take is that we have endeavoured to make provision to meet

the situation in the way we considered best, and in taking that responsibility we are prepared at the earliest possible date to submit the matter to the electors of the State. If the electors endorse the financial proposals of the Government in connection with this and other matters, they will be re-submitted, and I will not accept dictation on financial proposals from other than those responsible to the people, namely the Government of the day. I have been personally abused by all and sundry because the Government have introduced this measure. Misrepresentation has been indulged in by people who ought to know better. There has been a lamentable display of ignorance by people holding high places in this State with regard to the methods of carrying on the finances of the State.

Hon. Frank Wilson : That is not a statement ; it is only an assertion.

The PREMIER : It is not an assertion ; it is a definite statement and it is absolutely true.

Hon. Frank Wilson : Go on the hustings and tell the people that.

The PREMIER : The people I refer to are not familiar with the simplest methods of State finance, and if they are, it is less to their credit to deliberately misrepresent the position.

Hon. Frank Wilson : Who are they ?

The PREMIER : I said certain people holding high places.

Hon. Frank Wilson : I opposed this method of raising taxation and the Premier is attacking me now.

Mr. SPEAKER : Order !

Hon. Frank Wilson : I am rising on a point of order.

Mr. SPEAKER : Will the hon. member mention his point of order.

Mr. O'Loughlen : Will the hon. member apologise for defying the Chair ?

Hon. Frank Wilson : The hon. member is indulging in an attack upon me and my followers.

The PREMIER : I deny that ; you are occupying a very humble position.

Hon. Frank Wilson : I occupy a very responsible position.

Mr. SPEAKER : Will the hon. member state his point of order.

Hon. Frank Wilson : The Premier has attacked myself and others who opposed the method of raising money under this measure. He is going over all the ground which was covered during the second reading debate.

Mr. SPEAKER : No point of order is involved. The hon. member must not be continually rising in his chair.

Hon. Frank Wilson : But he is attacking us.

Mr. O'Loughlen : Will he apologise ?

Mr. SPEAKER : If the leader of the Opposition attempts to browbeat me, he also will apologise.

Hon. Frank Wilson : I am not attempting to browbeat you ; I would not dream of so doing.

Mr. SPEAKER : The hon. member must not rise in his place to interrupt the remarks of the leader of the Government. When I think the Premier is departing from the Standing Orders, I shall notify him and call him to order.

The PREMIER : With another attempt I will endeavour to make the statement I propose to this Chamber and to the people of the State. I said I had been abused in a personal way, that the position had been misrepresented, and in my opinion wilfully misrepresented, and by some there had been a woeful and appalling display of ignorance in regard to the condition of the finances, and the way in which they are controlled and operated. I stated I had been abused by people holding high positions in the State. May I also explain that there is an object to the opposition of this measure. I am not referring to the Chamber or anyone in it, or to another place. I am referring to the opposition that developed amongst one section of the community. It was a sight that I regret all people of the State could not witness. I refer to the manner in which certain individuals rolled up for the purpose of making their presence felt when this matter was being discussed. The lobbying that took place, and the letters which appeared in the Press did not really put these people in their true light before the whole State. We have had quite a number of proposals submitted from

various quarters, and underlying the whole of the opposition is the one outstanding fact, that under the proposals we submitted and which have been rejected, it was endeavoured to make those well able to contribute to the revenue of the State do so.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order! The hon. member is again discussing legislation which was passed by this House, and rejected by another Chamber; it is not a statement he is making.

The PREMIER: All right. I will read Sir Newton Moore's speech.

Mr. SPEAKER: I shall be glad if the Premier will.

The PREMIER: It appears on page 1503 of *Hansard* of 1907, Volume 31—

With your permission, Mr. Speaker, I desire to make a statement to the House. No doubt it is within the knowledge of the hon. members of this House that last evening the Legislative Council again rejected the land taxation proposals of the Government, notwithstanding that these proposals had received practically the unanimous approval of members of this House. On the first occasion last session, the Land Tax Assessment Bill was carried on the voices; and on the last occasion, in this session, it was carried with an overwhelming majority, there being only four dissentients to the proposal. It is hardly necessary for me to dwell on the gravity of the constitutional aspect raised by the action taken in interfering with the provisions proposed to be made for the purpose of providing funds for the Government's developmental policy.

I do not know whether that is an attack on the Council or not.

In the first place, I would point out that Ministers are responsible to this House, and that only by an adverse vote of this House can they be called upon to resign. Although the consent of both Houses is indispensable to give legal effect and validity to financial as well as to other measures, the sole right rests with the Assembly of originating all measures of this description. This

principle was established in England as long ago as 1678, when the Commons passed a resolution which declared that—

“All aids and supplies and aids to His Majesty in Parliament are the sole gift of the Commons, and all Bills for the granting of any such aids ought to begin with the Commons, and that it is the undoubted and sole right of the Commons to direct, limit, and appoint in such Bills the ends, purposes, considerations, conditions, limitations, and qualifications of such grants, which ought not to be changed or altered by the House of Lords.”

Proceeding, Sir Newton Moore went on to say—

Since that date, proceedings between the two Houses in England have strictly been in accordance with this resolution. The control of the public finances rests with the House of Commons as a constitutional right; they are presumed to be the best judges of the financial position of the State, its obligations and requirements. The same practice prevails here, and in this House are vested the same rights as are vested in the British House of Commons. It must be apparent that special revenue must be raised to carry out the large public works which are proposed to be undertaken at the present time, such for instance as the Port Hedland-Marble Bar Railway, the Mount Magnet Black Range Railway, the Fremantle Graving Dock, the Narrogin-Wickepin Railway, and many other railways that have been approved and projected; and the Government in this instance have asked for nothing unreasonable, and resent the unwarrantable stand taken by another place, which is tantamount to a refusal of supplies. I am allowed to read this, but I cannot say anything like it.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Very different wording.

The Attorney General: It makes no difference.

The PREMIER: I can just imagine what the attitude of the leader of the

Opposition would be if I referred to the conduct of the Council as being unwarranted. He would be on his feet very quickly protesting against my statement.

Mr. Male: Rightly too.

The PREMIER: Sir Newton Moore went on to say—

Whatever may be the outcome of this trouble, whatever cost the country may be put to, whatever loss the State may suffer in consequence, I wish to emphatically place the responsibility on the shoulders of those members of another place who have rejected the fiscal policy of the Government, and the expressed desire of the people's House. [General applause.]

I only need to repeat that for the purpose of making my statement, I was pointing out that we were endeavouring—

Hon. Frank Wilson: No you were not; you have been slinging mud right and left.

The PREMIER: We were endeavouring by introducing the measure to raise the necessary funds to tide us over the present difficulties, and I explained that the responsibility of rejecting that measure, and placing us in the position that we shall not be able to meet the difficulties that will arise, and so safeguard the best interests of the State—the responsibility, I repeat will not rest on the shoulders of the Government or of this Chamber, but on those who have taken up the attitude of opposition to the measure, not so much because they disagreed with the necessity for raising money, but because the measure would compel those well able to bear the strain to contribute according to their ability.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Please finish reading the whole of Sir Newton Moore's statement.

The PREMIER: It does not affect the position.

Hon. Frank Wilson: That was a statement; this one is not. You read the statement through now that you have commenced it.

The PREMIER: I know what the hon. member wants me to do. He wants me to read it through and show that at the conclusion the Premier said he

would resign, and he would go to the country in order to get a further expression of opinion on that particular question.

The Minister for Works: And he did not do so.

The PREMIER: He merely adjourned to a further date, and somersaulted as soon as Parliament met again.

Hon. Frank Wilson: No.

The PREMIER: Yes. Because St. George's Terrace got at the ear of the Government.

Hon. Frank Wilson: His resignation was refused.

The PREMIER: Of course it was refused; on his own advice.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Finish his statement, and then you try it on.

The PREMIER: I do not propose to do anything of the kind. I will follow the proper course. Parliament will expire by effluxion of time on the 1st November, and we decided before this measure was introduced that we would appeal to the people on the 21st October. There is nothing to be gained by my resigning at this stage, nothing whatever; but let me tell the hon. member that had it not been for the fact that we had decided to approach the electors next month, and to-day being the last day of our session, I would have placed my resignation in the hands of the Governor, because I decline, either now or in the future to carry on the responsibility of financing the State if another Chamber can take the control of the finances out of our hands. May I point out that the attitude adopted by those people who rejected our method of financing during this trying period will be better understood if I explain to hon. members that the proposal we submitted provided that all companies and firms should pay on their profits, not on their dividends declared, as is the case under the present Land and Income Tax Act.

Hon. Frank Wilson: This is a lovely statement.

The PREMIER: It is a true one.

Hon. Frank Wilson: No, it is not.

The PREMIER: It is due to the fact that the St. George's terrace people

were able to see that they could not dodge their responsibilities as they had been doing in the past—

Hon. Frank Wilson: You do not fight fairly. You are making an attack now. It is not a statement to the House.

Mr. O'Loughlen: Suppose it is an attack.

The PREMIER: Is there any place in Western Australia more suitable than this Chamber in which to explain the position of the Government, and to show the attitude of those who have been offering opposition? Has this House not been created for the purpose of removing the restrictions which are attached to the making of utterances on a public platform?

Mr. Male: Do not make another second reading speech.

The PREMIER: I am doing nothing of the kind. What I am trying to show is that in the past certain companies and firms have dodged their responsibilities to the State.

Hon. Frank Wilson: That is dealing with the Bill.

The PREMIER: I am not speaking in connection with the Bill. It is the Land and Income Tax Bill which is in operation at the present time that I am going to endeavour to refer to. Under this measure and the Dividends Duties Act they have been able so to arrange the affairs of their company or firm that they have dodged paying any tax at all. I am going to relate one or two instances of the methods that have been adopted. In some instances local companies, in order to evade taxation, have capitalised their profits, that is, they have not shown their profits in the usual way. I should like to mention just one case for the purpose of proving my argument.

Mr. Male: They are not doing anything illegal.

The PREMIER: I am not asserting that they are; I am not making any such statement, but I do say that under the Act which is in operation they can do these things, and do them legally.

Mr. Male: Of course they can; what is the matter with that?

The PREMIER: Nothing at all, except that it is absolutely unfair.

Mr. Male: It is not unfair.

The PREMIER: I say that it is unfair. Our proposal is that these people should pay on the profits they derive by carrying on their businesses in Western Australia. We hold that they have no right at a time like this to ask the wage earner, whose income is perhaps only £100 a year, to contribute something for the purpose of tiding the State over the present difficulty, and yet be allowed to continue themselves to evade their just and fair share in the way of contributing to the revenue of the State. Many companies have adopted this procedure, some for the sole purpose of evading taxation.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Is it legitimate for the Premier to argue as to the attitude of companies towards the measure, and to talk of what they are doing, such as swindling the Government, and all that sort of thing? We have had it over and over again.

Hon. W. C. Angwin (Honorary Minister): It is like the State steamers.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am most desirous of allowing the Premier to make a statement, but I must insist that he is making a speech and not a statement. He is arguing the merits of certain questions. I hope he will confine himself to making a statement. There is no objection whatever to the Premier making a statement on the lines of that made by Sir Newton Moore. Such statement may well be admitted.

Hon. Frank Wilson: It was a fair statement for the Premier at the time to make. Let the Premier read it through.

The Minister for Lands: I suppose it is not a fair statement now.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Hon. members need not laugh like a lot of dingoes. The Premier is making an attack all the time.

The Minister for Lands: So did Sir Newton Moore.

Hon. Frank Wilson: No, he made a dignified statement.

The Attorney General: He called the attack of another place unwarranted.

The PREMIER: I think it will be found when *Hansard* records the debate that others have made more attacks than I have particularly the leader of the Opposition.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Let us get away; we came here for the purpose.

The PREMIER: I am trying to show that as the Government have to carry the responsibility for administering the affairs of the State—

Hon. Frank Wilson: You are saying that the companies are dishonest and getting out of their tax.

The PREMIER: I do hope the hon. member will stop interjecting. When he has done I will proceed.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order! The hon. member may proceed. There must be no further interjections. If there are I am going to take strong action.

The PREMIER: The Government have to carry the responsibility for administering the affairs of the State until Parliament re-assembles. During that time I anticipate we will have tremendous difficulties to face. We have endeavoured to meet them already in a manner that we consider to be in the best interests of the State as a whole. Another place, however, has refused to give us power to do that, and we must now carry on as best we can under prevailing conditions, for which we are not responsible. As Sir Newton Moore pointed out—

I recognise the difficulty of dealing with such a situation, where the members of the Legislative Assembly can be penalised by the action of others who cannot be sent to their electors. At the same time, it is impossible that we can tamely submit to an act which reverses the relationships of the two Houses, revolutionises the Constitution and places the Assembly and the Ministers of its approval at the mercy of the second Chamber, whose function should rather be that of a House of review than that of a Chamber where the fiscal policy of a Government may be dictated.

That is what I am trying to make. I have to make my fiscal arrangements to meet the prevailing conditions.

Hon. Frank Wilson: Do not argue the point, but make a statement.

The PREMIER: I am endeavouring to show reasons why it is necessary I should make a statement. We have to make our fiscal arrangements in order to meet the conditions now prevailing. The second Chamber has exceeded its functions in refusing to give us its support when that support was most necessary. Their action is tantamount to refusing us supplies to enable us to tide over the present difficulty. Sir Newton Moore went on to say—

It is impossible to consider the vote of last night as anything but a rebuff to this Chamber; and having considered the matter with a full sense of the responsibility attached to my office, and realising that my first duty was to preserve the honour and dignity of the Government and the Assembly, I lost no time last evening in waiting on His Excellency the Governor, and unreservedly placing in his hands the resignation of myself and my colleagues. I have received this morning an intimation from His Excellency that he is unwilling to accept my resignation, he being of opinion that the Government retain the confidence of this House.

Mr. Male: Has the Premier done the same?

The PREMIER: I do not require His Excellency to tell me that I have the confidence of this House; I know it very well.

Mr. Male: That is very satisfactory.

Member: You will get it again.

The PREMIER: The remainder of Sir Newton Moore's statement merely went to show that he fell in with the views of His Excellency, and withdrew his resignation, and that it was proposed to dissolve Parliament, when he would submit the measure again. Our fiscal proposals have been rejected. We have a difficult position to face, and just as Sir Newton Moore pointed out that he was not prepared to shoulder the responsibility of holding up public works, I, in turn, am not prepared to shoulder the responsibility of carrying the unemployed difficulty during the coming two months,

and at the same time to carry the farmers and storekeepers who are suffering through the present agricultural depression.

Mr. O'Loughlen : They are in a desperate position.

The PREMIER : And no one knows it better than I do myself.

Mr. Turvey : And yet our friends claim to be the friends of the farmers.

The PREMIER ; Yes, and on the other hand they refuse to give us those supplies which would enable us to go to their assistance. That being the case, I desire, before Parliament closes, lest we should be misunderstood, to place on record the fact that the Government, appreciating at the time that we would probably be criticised and misrepresented, endeavoured to define their position fearlessly and clearly. As I have said before, we will carry the responsibility of our own action, but I want it to be clearly understood that those who refused to give us the necessary means to meet the present agricultural depression, and the various other difficulties which have arisen, must carry the responsibility of their action between this time and the time when the people can express their own opinion in the matter.

Hon. Frank Wilson : Let the Premier take his own responsibilities.

The PREMIER : I am taking my own responsibility. My responsibility is for the legislation which we introduce from time to time, and for the administrative acts of the Government. But I do want other people to take their full responsibility for having exceeded their legal rights in refusing to grant us supplies. I want those who will suffer by that action to appreciate the fact that, if funds are not available for the purpose of rendering assistance, the responsibility lies at the door of the second Chamber, by reason of the refusal of that Chamber, supported by the Opposition and their friends in St. George's terrace, to furnish the means required for that assistance. I want to make the position clear.

Hon. Frank Wilson : Take your own responsibility.

The PREMIER : I ask the leader of the Opposition to take his responsibility, too, in the matter. I say there will be during the next two months trouble and difficulty in the country such as will tax the utmost ingenuity of the Government to overcome—trouble and difficulty for which the Government are not in the slightest degree responsible. The agricultural depression which has overtaken this State is not due to any act of the present Government. The war is not due to any act of the present Government. The deplorable consequences of the agricultural depression and of the war are not due to any act of the Government, but are due to the act of others. When we have endeavoured to meet the situation and carry the responsibility of our actions, the matter has been taken out of our hands by another Chamber. I want to place on the shoulders of members of another House the responsibility for any distress which may be suffered by the community until the general election has taken place and Parliament has re-assembled. In any case, I say again, with Sir Newton Moore, that I am not prepared to sit down to a second Chamber which rejects the fiscal proposals of the Government, which takes out of the hands of the Government the control of the finances. The whole of the people bear the burden of taxation, and the whole of the people are represented through this Chamber alone. Blood has been spilt in the past for the maintenance of the principle that the people as represented through the Lower House—through the House of Commons in England, through the House of Assembly in this State—shall alone be responsible for levying taxation, and shall alone be responsible for the expenditure of public money when raised. I am not going to tolerate, nor are the Government going to tolerate, nor is the party sitting on the Ministerial side of the House willing to tolerate, a second Chamber so bitterly partisan as to reject the fiscal proposals of the Government time after time, as has been done in this State during the last three years. The responsibility for whatever may happen from now until Parliament re-assembles

will lie at the door of those who refused to grant the Government the funds which are required.

Hon. Frank Wilson : No, it will not.

The PREMIER : The responsibility will rest on those who refused to pass the fiscal proposals of the Government.

Hon. Frank Wilson : No.

The PREMIER : Absolutely it will. I am not going to submit to dictation from either the leader of the Opposition or from another Chamber in regard to the financial proposals of the Government. If our proposals on finance are not in the best interests of the community, the community will have the opportunity on the 21st October of saying so. I wish to inform the leader of the Opposition that I am prepared for that verdict just as he is. If the people disapprove of my actions, I am prepared to lay down the reins of Government. I am quite prepared to do that.

Hon. Frank Wilson : You will have to do it.

The PREMIER : Yes ; just as the hon. member had to do it three years ago. The people of the State will pass judgment on the matter then. I decline, however, to hand over the finances of the people of the State to a second Chamber, a bitterly partisan second Chamber, one that absolutely declines to allow the House which constitutionally controls the finances, to operate them in what the majority of that House believe to be the best interests of the whole of the taxpayers, and not of a section of the taxpayers. I am prepared, on behalf of the Government, to take the responsibility of our action ; and I want those who refused to grant us the necessary supplies, to take the responsibility of their action and of the results of their action during the next two months. I move—

That the House at its rising adjourn until Tuesday the 3rd November.

Hon. FRANK WILSON (Sussex) [5-35] : Have I the privilege to reply to the Premier, Mr. Speaker ?

Mr. SPEAKER : The hon. member has not the privilege of replying. I observe, however, that the Premier claimed by precedent the right to make

a statement. I have referred to the precedent, and I find that the leader of the Opposition of that day made a statement on the occasion referred to. Since the Premier's claim was based on that precedent, I intend to allow the leader of the Opposition to make a statement also.

Hon. FRANK WILSON : I cannot simply make a statement. The Premier has indulged in an attack from beginning to end, and I cannot honestly say that I am going to make a mere statement. If I may, I am going to reply to the Premier's arguments. First, I wish to point out that the course taken by the Premier is absolutely unfair in view of the arrangement made last night that we would meet here formally and adjourn after learning from the Legislative Council whether that Chamber had accepted the taxation measure or proposed to amend it. The Premier has made absolutely no statement. The only thing in the nature of a statement that he has indulged in is the allusion to a previous Premier in 1907.

Mr. O'Loughlen : That bowled you out.

Hon. FRANK WILSON : That, I submit, was a statement to all intents and purposes. But the whole of the other remarks of the Premier have been an attack, and a vicious attack, upon what he terms the St. George's terrace friends of the Opposition and on the leader of the Opposition.

Mr. SPEAKER : Order !

Hon. FRANK WILSON : And a pronouncement—

Mr. SPEAKER : Order ! I cannot allow the debate to proceed any further. The hon. member may make a statement giving reasons.

Hon. FRANK WILSON : I am answering the Premier's statements, which you have allowed him to make.

Mr. SPEAKER : Unfortunately, I cannot allow the hon. member to debate the Premier's statement.

Hon. FRANK WILSON : What am I to talk about then, Sir ? I am making a reply to the statement of the Premier, to show him how unfair and unjust he has been in his remarks.

Mr. Carpenter: Take the platform.

Hon. FRANK WILSON: I intend to take the platform. I am willing to take the platform at the Fremantle town hall with the hon. member any time he likes. May I reply to the Premier, Mr. Speaker?

Mr. SPEAKER: I regret I cannot allow the hon. member to reply. The question before the House is—

That the House at its rising adjourn until Tuesday, the 3rd November.

Question put and passed.

COMPLIMENTARY REMARKS.

The PREMIER (Hon. J. Scaddan—Brown Hill-Ivanhoe) [5.37]: Before the House adjourns I would ask leave, in an informal way, to congratulate you, Mr. Speaker, on behalf of members sitting on this side of the House, upon the completion of three years of office as Speaker of the House, and also to convey similar congratulations to the Chairman of Committees and his deputies. I cannot overlook, either, the valuable services rendered by the staff of the House. Members of the Government can probably appreciate the services of the staff even better than Opposition members can; and I take pleasure in saying that during the last three years the whole of the staff have always been ready and anxious to assist, to the utmost of their power, all members in response to any request which has been made. To our Clerk, Mr. Grant. I am personally indebted, because on many occasions that gentleman has helped me considerably by pointing out the necessary procedure to be adopted. I desire to tender my personal thanks to Mr. Grant. May I say, also, that whatever differences may have occurred, as they have occurred even during this very sitting, I consider that you, Sir, have invariably shown what a Speaker is expected to show—a due regard for the weak as well as for the strong in the Chamber, and that you have always extended the same consideration to members sitting on the Opposition side of the House as you have extended to members of the Ministry or to Government supporters. That attitude, I have always claimed, is the proper

attitude for a Speaker to adopt. If the Speaker shows any leaning whatever, it should be towards the side of the weak in preference to the side of the strong. I desire also to express my appreciation of the work of the *Hansard* staff. The members of that staff have had a strenuous time, especially during the last month or two. Not only have they had to report the debates in this Chamber and in another place, but they have also been called upon to report the proceedings of various Royal Commissions which have been sitting during that period. Those commissions, I may mention, have sat for fairly lengthy hours, and have kept the *Hansard* staff, to my personal knowledge, very busy indeed. I cannot say more than this, that whatever may happen at the coming elections, I hope that most hon. members—I suppose it is of no use saying that I hope all hon. members—will be returned. We will fight mightily on the public platform for the purpose of obtaining approval of our policies by the majority of the people. Whatever happens, all I can say is that, however strenuous the fight, I hope the same friendly feeling will continue to exist between members in their personal and private capacities as has existed in the past. On the whole the present Parliament has been rather a happy one. We have not had many disagreements of so serious a nature as to give rise to any great difficulties. This happy condition has been due in a large measure to the manner in which you, Sir, have controlled the House, and to the assistance rendered to you by the Chairman, the Deputy Chairmen, and the staff.

Hon. FRANK WILSON (Sussex) [5.41]: I can, of course, endorse fully all the complimentary things the Premier has said in regard to yourself, Sir, the Chairman of Committees, the Clerks and the other members of the staff of the Assembly, together with the members of *Hansard*, who have very trying duties to perform, especially on those occasions when we indulge in heated debate in the Chamber. I feel it is unnecessary for me to reiterate all the remarks made by the Premier. You will realise that, notwithstanding the heat which at times

is imported into the debate, giving rise to much interjection, and the fact that at times we may appear to be discourteous to some extent to the Chair, it is quite unintentional. We all respect you, both as an individual and in your high capacity as Speaker of the Assembly. I must say that you have endeavoured to carry out the duties of your position impartially. No doubt many of us feel occasionally that we are in the right, and you are in the wrong. Nevertheless, the authority of your position, of course must be recognised, and we readily bow, more particularly in our cooler moments, to the rulings you deliver. In regard to the forthcoming test at the general election, I am not dismayed by the overwhelming numbers opposed to us. We will give our opponents a willing go, and will endeavour to fight them fairly. I hope they will meet us in a similar spirit. Whoever may come out on top—

Mr. O'Loghlen : Will have a bad time of it.

Hon. FRANK WILSON : The defeated must bow to the decision of the people. I do not think I have been in the habit of squealing, and I am not likely to complain if our opponents should triumph once more. However, I fully anticipate that the present position will be reversed at the elections. I will be sorry, of course, to lose a number of the members occupying seats on that side; however, that is in the hands of the gods. We cannot do much. We have merely to put our case to the electors and let them decide the issue. That is my intention, and I think, notwithstanding a difference of political opinions, we may express the wish that we shall see you, Sir, back in the House after the general elections.

Mr. SPEAKER (Hon. M. F. Troy—Mount Magnet) [5.44] : I desire to express my sincere thanks to the Premier and the leader of the Opposition for their kindly references to myself whilst I have been an occupant of this Chair. I will admit that sometimes my position has been a pretty trying one, endeavouring, as I have, to do a fair thing all round.

If I have erred, I have not erred with any wilful intent. I fully recognise that when hon. members are heated, they do not readily obey the Chair; yet I have never experienced any act of discourtesy to the Chair. I do not forget that I was once down in the House myself, and that I then did the very things which hon. members do to-day, but there was never any intention to be offensive. Despite little drawbacks, my experiences in the Chair have been most pleasant, and I can say I have received every courtesy from members of the Assembly. I thank hon. members for their kindness to myself, and to the Clerks of the House, who have always been most loyal. I have never for a moment had occasion to doubt their loyalty, and during my term in the Chair they have rendered precisely the same services as they rendered in previous years. The same also may be said of the *Hansard* staff. I wish to express my thanks to the Chairman of Committees, Mr. Holman, who has performed his duties in a most admirable manner, and has been of great assistance to me. I may also say that the services rendered by Mr. McDowall, Mr. Price, and Mr. Male, as temporary Chairmen, have been most beneficial to the House, and of great assistance to myself and Mr. Holman. I again thank you, and I hope that, whatever the fortunes of war, those who do fall in the fight will be numbered only amongst the wounded, and may again appear in the fighting line.

House adjourned at 5.47 p.m.